
SINGAPORE - LAC Space
Monday, February 9, 2015 – 10:30 to 12:00
ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Buenos días! We have interpreters in front of your seats in case you need interpretation. I would strongly suggest you to have one of those in case you are not fully trilingual. We're going to have presentations in Portuguese, Spanish, English. They'll go back and forth. Probably Chinese, whoever wants to . . .

Will you please take a seat? There is sufficient space around for everybody.

In addition to the members present, we have the ambassador of Costa Rica in Singapore. We thank you very much for being here, and welcome. Let's start, because we have a very tight agenda. We will see how we move forward while we wait for the members who are not yet here.

Before I give the floor to Vanda, who will moderate this session, let me take a couple of minutes to make some comments about our agenda, which we see on screen. The first comment on this, Latin-American and Caribbean space, for those of you who are not involved in the creation and design of this strategic plan, the LAC Space has been designed to be primarily a space of interaction on economic matters in the domain name system.

Certainly the name given to it is not fortunate because it looks as if it's a Latin American space to speak about Latin American issues. But the

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

truth is that we are trying to be as inclusive as possible. However, the focus is still Latin America.

I now want to thank Vanda, Celia, [Debbie], [Stephen] for helping me lead the LAC Space in ICANN meetings, and therefore certainly build this highly interesting agenda.

I will also take this opportunity to invite you all present in your communities to import new topics, help us in reaching the agenda. This is an open invitation. The space belongs to you and to your communities.

We have always had – and we will have today as well – some time to talk about the update of this strategy plan. I think this is a good opportunity to interact on the progress made, but it is time for us to acknowledge that we cannot discuss the whole list of projects. As you may recall, we have already 45 projects. Out of the 70, there is a shortlist of 45. It will be too difficult to find a time for all of them, so we will highlight a couple of them – the most relevant ones which have made someone else progress.

And as Rodrigo Saucedo Rodrigo is the manager of the plan project. We will hold regular webinars to move forward and analyze each of the projects in detail for the community to be aware of them for transparency purposes.

In our strategy update, we have a very good balance with very interesting topics. There is a project that is a [consolidating] project dealing with the creation of a website for the region. We have Dev Anand who will present it, and Fatima was around. I hope she will be



around because both Dev and Fatima helped us in developing this project. It's a major achievement of the Latin American community, and with our coordination with LACRALO and other participants.

We also have Carolina Aguerre. There are some projects in the strategy involving the development of activities in ccTLDs, and Carolina will present the progress made.

We certainly welcome Bennette Thomas. Bennette is now a member of the fellows group, but he is also an active contributor and participant of the planned activities in the Caribbean. He will therefore present which is a project we are considered in there.

Then the hot topic, the strong topic of this ICANN meeting and of last year's agenda as well, is the topic of the IANA stewardship transition and our participation as a region has been outstanding in the different existing groups – ICG, CCWG, CWG.

At an overall level, many participants from our region, from our community, were involved in these matters. It's very interesting, therefore, to know what happened in the numbers space. It's not to neglect the naming space, but we should recognize that our region [develop] proposals with numbers. So Esteban will make an update on the CRISP, which is involved with us. Then we have two other very special guests, remotely some of them, and others face-to-face in this room who will present about interesting topics in economic terms.

We have Professor Antonio Alberti from INATEL, which is an institute of telecommunications research from Brazil. He'll be remotely presenting on the future of the Internet. I hope you will find it interesting.



Then we have Urs. Urs is here to present a case of a new gTLD, which despite not being based in our region has been conceived for our region for companies, for corporations, both stock corporations or limited liability companies in Brazil. I think that will be interesting and will also be functional for other countries in the region as we will see in the presentation.

Finally, there will be some time for questions and answers. Vanda, I don't know if you want to make any introductory remarks before we start with the plan.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

No, I just want to thank you all for being here because we've seen that our space is gaining strengths, is creating interest. I will just say that the purpose here is to open up the space to the entire community because we are having here an opportunity to do business in the region, so it is open to everybody, not just to Latin Americans. It is undoubtedly a fact that we Latin Americans want to know how things are going, but for those parties who are interested in doing business, this is an opportunity to know what is happening in our region, and therefore expand the network and there's currently further business opportunities with our region with us and those coming after us.

So the conception here is exchange and sharing information between regions. I would also like to say that we have remote participation of African Portuguese speaking participants and from other regions as well – Spain, Portugal – who have business interests in Latin America, strong interests, and therefore can take advantage of everything we are doing.

So without further ado, we should start because we don't have much time for all the things we have planned.

Is Rodrigo already up and live, connected?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Our first participant is remotely, Rodrigo Saucedo. Do we have him on the line?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Yeah.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Rodrigo, go ahead. Can you hear us? We cannot hear Rodrigo. Rodrigo, can you speak?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Where is he, in [inaudible]?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Bolivia.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: You're kidding. And you expect to hear him?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Well, it's a little far, but anyway, he can [inaudible]. They are very high over there. You know the signal is good.



UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Guys, what do you think from back there? I'll just be informal. How do we look to get Rodrigo from remote?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: [Speaking Spanish]

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Will you please take the floor, Rodrigo, when you're able to? Shout or whatever.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: We can't hear you. Will you please speak louder? Maybe we can go ahead with you and go back to Rodrigo. Can you speak?

RODRIGO SAUCEDO: Hello?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Ah! That's Rodrigo.

RODRIGO SAUCEDO: Good morning, everybody. I think that the meeting has started full flesh today and I believe it will be a very interesting wee. Today I will give you an overview on the regional strategy.

As you know, the strategy was presented in April 2013 at the Beijing meeting, and after that, the five pilot projects or starting projects



began. Actually, there are more than five. There was a total of 15 which were merged into these five. By May 2014, we started with the implementation plan.

This plan basically groups the various projects into categories for the [inaudible] implementation and follow up. This plan also divides the other projects in two implementation periods. The first period will go from August 2014 to August 2015.

I can see you are not able to see the presentation, the PPT show. Let me check.

So out of the 75 projects comprised in the regional strategy (as I said before, 15) were included into these so-called pilot projects. In the first period of implementation going from August 2014 to 2015, we have 37 projects to be implemented, and the next period will start in June 2015 ending in June 2016.

Out of the 37 projects that will be implemented in this first period, we have already started with implementation of 19. The remaining 18 are still to be implemented out of the 19 projects being implemented. There are observatories, inventories, on ccTLD development. We are working with LACRALO on webinars, on capacity building, with the Caribbean. We have set up a working group as well, a communications group and the website.

As Rodrigo said, I'm not going to explain each project in detail because it will take a long time. However, from next month, there will be a monthly update by means of a webinar for the entire community during



which we will explain in depth, in detail, each of the projects that are being implemented.

As Rodrigo said well, we have Dev Anand, Carolina Aguirre and Benette Thomas who will present on some of the projects that we are already implementing in our regional strategy. Thank you very much.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you, Rodrigo. We were not able to show your presentation. However, we will be circulating it afterwards and it will be included in the minutes of the meeting, of this session. So the figures you have given us will be available to everybody. Thank you, Rodrigo.

We are going to invite Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Hello. This is Dev Anand. Are you hearing me?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you. Just wait a little bit. You have slides also?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: No, he's going to share his screen. If that's not possible . . . We want to try to do it. Yes, it's going to be possible. Thank you, Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Are you seeing my screen now?



UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Not yet. Just a minute. Okay, you are there.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: No, we're still not there. We're showing something already live from the Internet. Now we're going to switch to Dev driving this. We are all there and we will all be there to some extent or the other.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, are you seeing my screen now?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Not yet.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. So you are seeing my screen? Okay. Thank you. Since you are seeing my screen, let's [inaudible] Singapore.

My name is Dev Anand Teelucksingh. I'm one of the communications project leaders from the Latin American and Caribbean Regional Strategic Plan. The other person being Fatima Cambronero. We are both on the [inaudible] At-Large community and members of LACRALO. Fatima and I were involved on the website project as the leaders of the communication project plan.

So this new regional website is by and for ICANN Latin American and Caribbean team. So it's a community-driven effort. The first look at this work-in-progress website is really thanks to the significant efforts of NIC Argentina, and particularly [Miguel] Estrada and [inaudible] who were in charge of the development, design, and the hosting of the website.



So, as I said, this is a work in progress, so some sections are not complete. So let's look at [inaudible].oarg. The homepage is the place that we the community can share ICANN-related news happening in the region.

As you can see right now, you can see a rotating banner pictures and news [inaudible] where you can click and read more about those details, followed by various ICANN social media links. Then a map of the website at the very bottom.

You see it's very familiar in style to ICANN's website. So a new person to ICANN's Latin American and Caribbean community coming to this site won't be disoriented when [inaudible] ICANN's website. You'll see the bar in blue showing the links to the different language versions of the website. While you see only English and Spanish now, we are going to be having Portuguese and French versions of the website [inaudible] used in the region.

Just a quick [inaudible] various sections of the website. 'About Us' tries to explain what ICANN is to the newcomer, explaining what exactly does "assigned" mean and assigned number mean to that person, and what exactly is WHOIS.

Under 'Strategic Plan', this is where we relate details about our Latin American and Caribbean [inaudible] read more and see updates related to the strategic plan.

Under 'Participate' you'll see the various participation opportunities available to members in the Latin American and Caribbean region. Not just the ICANN events, but also other events [inaudible] Internet-related



organizations in the region, as well as a link to the ICANN's public comments where of course people can [inaudible] on this ICANN policies.

Under 'Maps', the intent behind it is to – and I'll quickly show this. It is to show a map of the region where we can find various indicators. Like I said, the information on this is still [inaudible] purposes only. But for example, we can highlight the number of [inhabitants] in Brazil and there are other [indicators] like Internet users, whether they are using IDN and so forth. [inaudible] to the Caribbean as well and so forth. Again, this is still a work in progress.

Under Organization in the LAC region, it gives a listing of all the various – and an explanation also – of all the various organizations in Latin American and Caribbean [inaudible] LACNIC, LAC TLD, Internet Society, the Caribbean Telecommunications Union, and so forth.

Under 'Observatories', this is going to be a section dedicated to [inaudible] reports and other aspects of the LAC strategic plan – DNS security and so forth.

Under 'News and Press', as the name implies, all the news and press releases, and including the Latin American and Caribbean newsletter that has been published as part of the communications plan.

Then, finally, a 'Contact Us' section where you can contact us.

So that's just [inaudible] work in progress. Please contribute to this effort by contacting us and sharing your comments, news or pictures for the headers. Thanks and I'll stop right now. Thank you!



VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you. Fatima, can you add something, too? Because you are involved within this project. Maybe it will be more clear for the people in general.

FATIMA CAMBRONERO: Thank you, Vanda. Dev's presentation is quite comprehensive. I would just like to add that the website is a sub-project which is part of the [inaudible] communication project which includes the website and gathering material and information in various languages spoken in the region and the material is used to [populate] the website.

On the other hand, another sub-project in the [inaudible] communications team is to write the bi-monthly newsletters which we are distributing, and in a few days we will be distributing an annual report, including all information and newsletters from last year, sharing the news very important for the region.

I'd like to highlight what Dev said. This website is a work in process, so everything you think may be interesting and important for the region in the languages spoken in the region. You may submit that information to Dev, myself or to any of the Rodrigos [inaudible] an important participant in this project. So you submit this information to us and we will upload it, distribute it.

I'd like to think especially our friends from NIC Argentina. They are sitting over there – [inaudible] who has been working very hard on a voluntary basis and in collaboration with others. So I think this would be it.



Again, I would like to tell you this is a space for us, for the community, to communicate everything which is important for us. So any information you would like us to upload, please do so.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you, Fatima. We'll give the floor to Carolina.

CAROLINA AGUIRRE: Thank you very much, Vanda. Good morning, everybody. The ccTLDs in the ICANN strategy for the region play a very important role. When the projects and the themes that were more important for the region were listed, we were surprised that many of our colleagues thought that the ccTLD world was an area where we had to work harder and in a more comprehensive fashion, so we are very committed to working with ICANN in order to set forth – or to work hard in the development of ccTLDs in the technical business and sustainability components working with pioneering and leading organizations for Internet in the region.

We are participating in several projects from the TLD. We provide support with several leaders of the various ccTLDs involved in various projects, and simultaneously, we provide support to ICANN staff to make these strategies feasible – sorry [inaudible] ccTLDs.

We are very happy to tell you that we are starting to make progress with the plan to develop or to carry out a study on business sustainability and business development strategies for ccTLDs.

Most of the registries in the region or the country codes come from the academia world and it has been very tough on many of them to be

sustainable and to carry out a strategy within the universities for them to be considered as entities that have to be [inaudible] and self-sustainable, actually, in order to face the pressure and requirements they face from the regions.

ccTLDs in our region have the highest growth rates, 8% a year on average. It's a community which still has a long way to grow, especially considering that in other regions the growth rates are much lower, but this means more pressure for the infrastructure, human resources and the support through a strategy that will help smaller ccTLDs to develop these practices in creating functional areas within the registry and specific strategies for the business areas. Well, these are very important activities we should carry out to help them become sustainable.

We expect to have a draft report to share with you in the Buenos Aires meeting. We hope to have a final report by September based on the feedback and the work we will carry out in Buenos Aires.

ccTLDs are also participating in other projects [inaudible] exchange and support for the implementation of various projects. We are right now working with ccTLDs giving them support for training and development through the exchange of [stuff]. They may be considered [internships], but actually we have concrete requests from several registries that need support for a full implementation. They need signed agreements. They need [PP] implementation.

And simultaneously, we have staff working at larger registries or other registries who have those skilled human resources where we have mapped the [inaudible] ccTLDs that have those and met needs and requirements and those other registries that have those resources



required by other ccTLDs, so we will have this exchange set up by June. At Buenos Aires we will communicate what this experience has been like.

We also have our colleagues from NIC Chile who were already developing a country-wide project, DNS observatory. They have been very interested in developing a more comprehensive strategy for the region dealing with incidents and watching or surveying the behavior of the DNS. Some people are already working on this project.

For the time being, considering the ccTLD world, we are basically doing what I have been telling you about. I haven't mentioned this yet, but when we did this mapping, this diagnosis, of the scenario and training needs of ccTLDs [inaudible] we were focusing strongly – well, we have a development, sustainability projects for the business area of registries and we also are working on the area of security, stability, and resiliency. This is [inaudible]. We have been working on this consistently for several years now.

But this exchange of stuff, this [internships] are focusing on those areas, trying to meet those unmet requirements. We are also working with our colleagues from ICANN and ISOC, John Graham's team. So we are already thinking about the new areas for training, which we will be developing in 2015.

So this is the update I can give you, and I'm willing to answer any questions you may have.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Are you working with IPv6 in the region?

CAROLINA AGUIRRE: This is always one of the indicators we look at. If ccTLDs have already deployed IPv6 in their servers, in their own servers, fortunately there are only two registries in the region who are not members of the LAC TLD. I don't know exactly what they are doing, but if it's not [inaudible] implementation, at least they have the IPv6 service through another organization. But right now, the implementation of IPv6 in the ccTLDs in Latin America and in the Caribbean is [inaudible] already. That is they have IPv6 in their own servers.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: . . . from the Saint Lucia ICT Association. Is there some participation from ccTLDs in the Caribbean or can this be improved?

CAROLINA AGUIRRE: LAC TLD has nine members from the Caribbean, so when we talk about LAC TLD we are saying that one-third of our members are in the Caribbean and we are an organization working in a bilingual fashion, so we are always open and available to work with ccTLDs from the Caribbean and from other regions because we also work with ccTLDs which are not in Latin America and the Caribbean but who want to work with us. So our doors are always open for them to participate.

When we organize meetings in the Caribbean on any subject matter, we also open our doors not only for ccTLDs that are members of LAC TLD, but for anybody willing to participate.

OLGA CAVALLI:

Olga Cavalli from Argentina speaking. As Carolina didn't have too much to do, I invited her to participate in a new project which we are going to launch. She looks at me and she smiles. This is a mapping [inaudible] from Trinidad and Tobago, and those of you who would like to join us, you're welcome. We are going to do the mapping of universities and [inaudible] organizations that deal with issues that are relevant for the ICANN strategy. We are sort of delayed because we are overworked, but I talked about this to Rodrigo in El Salvador and we will start doing this as soon as possible, as soon as we have some time. So if you would like to join us, you're welcome. [inaudible] English? No, it's okay. That's it. Thank you very much.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Yesterday we talked about the project to include all the Caribbean colleagues in the strategic projects – in all the projects, as a matter of fact – in the strategic project that will feed other projects. That's why we have here Bennette Thomas who will tell us how this working group was set up, this Caribbean working group was set up. Welcome, Bennette. Thank you very much for being here with us.

BENNETTE THOMAS:

First of all, my name is Bennette Thomas and I'm the director of telecoms in the government of Dominica. By the way, I am indeed a



member of the fellowship group. I am also a member of the GAC, and I've heard a lot of interesting discussions going on in the GAC.

As you know, ICANN has a large multi-stakeholder system and model, so that every country has an opportunity to speak and highlight the issues relevant to it in the entire ICANN community.

I know that the topic this morning is going to be looking mostly at the strategic plan. However, we had a Caribbean caucus of members and we had some concerns as to the, for want of a better word, the marginalization of the Caribbean countries in the LAC space.

It was interesting to note this morning that as we speak one member mentioned it is a LAC, which is Latin American and Caribbean, but it seems to be more Latin American than Caribbean. Interestingly, if you look at the participation of the LAC, you'll find that there's a rather low representation of the Caribbean countries on the issues affecting the countries in terms of accessibility to Internet services, accessibility in terms of the various benefits associated with being in ICANN.

It's because of this kind of marginalization, we have come together as a group. I believe we have about well over ten members already from the Caribbean countries. We have, of course, you know Albert Daniels is a member of the ICANN staff. He is from Saint Lucia. We have myself from Dominica. Grenada is there. In a ministerial level, the honorable [inaudible] is a member of the GAC. Right here with me, Dr. Spencer Thomas, he is from Grenada. He is also a member of the GAC. There is Carlton Samuels from Jamaica. He is involved in a number of agencies in ICANN. We have other players, [inaudible] and we have Rodney Taylor from Barbados.



So we have a number of persons and we have [inaudible]. Of course you cannot forget Tracy Hackshaw from Trinidad and Jacqueline Morris. We have Cintra and we have Dev. We have a lot of persons already involved in the process, but we are not seeing the corresponding benefits associated with the countries.

Another result, we have put a Caribbean working group together consisting of a number of individuals I mentioned. We have established a mailing list, so that persons can be contacted and communicated with.

One of the major issues you may have a working group, you may have a mailing list, but if there is an accessibility problem, we have persons who have limited access or sometimes they have no access to being part of these kind of conferences and meetings where seminars and webinars are going on and persons because of lack of accessibility to these services are not able to participate in a meaningful way.

These are issues that need to be looked into if we are going to have any meaningful participation in [inaudible]. We cannot be trying to bring the issues of ICANN together among member [states] on the unique issues of accessibility and not being able to participate properly. They are not addressed in this. Otherwise [inaudible] continue to be marginalized.

We have also the working group began working with other governments in the region to ensure that [inaudible] participation of member states. I think Albert is doing a good job going around and showing that the various countries and governments and ensure that if there are any activities that we inform him and he comes together, and we ensure that this takes place.



So we are making some progress, but much more can be done and I am hoping that at the end of this session we can meet with maybe Rodrigo Saucedo and Rodrigo de la Parra and see how we can increase participation further and collaboration [inaudible] and the rest of the island or doing.

Interestingly, I just came from Trinidad and we had a number of persons from the Caribbean and the LAC region at the CTU meeting. For those of you who are not aware, the CTU is the Caribbean Telecommunications Union. They have just celebrated their 25th anniversary in Trinidad and a number of the members, the Caribbean members, were at that meeting.

So there are a number of other countries that are seeking membership or who want to take an active role in ICANN from the Caribbean. As you know, the Caribbean is not only independent territories, they are associated territories. They are places like Montserrat, Cayman Islands, Turks and Caicos Islands who are willing, but they are very small entities and they're not able to have access to what we are doing here.

I am here because I am actively taking part of it. Spencer is here, Tracy and the rest, Carlton. But a number of critical issues effect the active participation of a number of countries.

So I would really appreciate whether we can have the more collaborative effort to ensure that other islands within the region – at this point, I will stop here and take any questions.



UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you. I guess you can talk with Rodrigo afterwards. Okay, thank you. Esteban?

ESTEBAN LESCANO: Hello, I am Esteban Lescano from Argentina. I work in CABASE as chair of the legal department, and it is an honor for me to be one of the CRISP team members for the LACNIC community together with Andres Piazza who is LACNIC staff and Nico Scheper from Curacao [inaudible] Caribbean.

The purpose of this presentation is to tell you a little bit what the CRISP team is about within the framework of the IANA stewardship transition, more specifically for member resources of the Internet, which you know are IPv4, IPv6 addresses and the autonomous system names.

The CRISP team has 15 members from the five [inaudible], three per [inaudible]. And one of the members represents the [staff] and the other two represent the community.

The RIRs are RIPE, AfriNIC, APNIC, ARIN, and LACNIC. So the five regions into how the world is divided for Internet member resources. In the first CRISP team chair and a vice chair were appointed.

We should also note that each RIR community followed its own process of appointment of CRISP members. There was therefore a regional process. Each community selected its own process and the CRISP team successfully developed a unified proposal to be presented to the ICG. So there is a regional process, a global process, so to say for consolidation or streamlining of the proposals.

Now, the process. The process followed by the CRISP team. There were several activities. There was dates which was – we started on December 9. We worked until the 15th of January. The purpose was to consolidate in a single proposal each of the RIR proposals. There were 14 conference calls involved in the CRISP team members, and they were also open to observers.

During the process two drafts were produced and a final proposal. The first draft was of December 19 and the second January 8, and the entire debate was carried forward over the mailing list for the IANA transition of the [inaudible]. It is a public list open to the entire community.

An interesting aspect to note is that this was a process with a 24-hour window. There was, therefore, a given point in time for the certain topic when there were no more comments, no more observations, no further remarks. So there was a waiting time of 24 hours to set consensus. The final proposals was afterwards submitted to the ICG therefore on time, complying with the deadline in the schedule which was January 15.

Now if we consider the main issues or the main points in the proposal, the entire proposal is on the NRO's website. The main points are for ICANN to continue as the IANA numbering services operator, for numbering resources. There was an issue, a point discussed in the debate that is related to intellectual property rights, also in relation to number resources. The proposal, therefore, goes that the intellectual property rights should remain with the community.

Another main point is entering into a service level agreement with the IANA numbering services operator. Another very interesting aspect is to



establish a review committee. I will give you further details later on, but this was an idea that was conceived within the LACNIC community.

Now, very quickly, ICANN to continue as the IANA numbering services operator. Why? Because there is satisfaction among the RIRs. The communities are satisfied with the performance of ICANN in this function, so the proposal is for ICANN to continue with minimal changes only in operational terms in the existing arrangement for the provision of these services.

The purpose here is because the NTIA of the United States will be replaced by the RIRs, which are therefore the stakeholders for the management of the numbering resources will be the RIRs.

There will be no impact on policy development. That is to say there will be no impact on the operational functions of the IANA.

The intellectual property rights involved the IANA brand, the domain iana.org, and the database is for the allocation of IP addresses and [inaudible] numbers.

In the proposal developed by the CRISP team, it says that the number resources are public resources. Therefore, its ownership should be separated by the operator. They should remain with the community irrespective of who the operator is. At present, it is ICANN and it is [suspected] that it will continue like that, but there must be a separation here.

The ownership of the brand and the ownership of the iana.org, the proposal is to transfer to the IETF trust, which is the repository of the intellectual property developed for Internet protocols and parameters.



This whole issue of intellectual property is a sort of mechanism to guarantee that the resources will not be used in a discriminatory manner for the discrimination of community.

Then we have the Service Level Agreement, which is a new contract, a new agreement, between the RIRs and ICANN. The [inaudible] government is excluded here. That's where the transition takes place. And in disagreement, the terms and conditions are said for quality of service and the requirements on the provision of the service and how the reporting of compliance should be carried out.

The breach in requirements will also be included in the Service Level Agreement as well as a mechanism of dispute resolution. The proposal – and this should be taken into consideration – the proposal only includes general principles. Any SLA should include. There are no specific details because we worked with the purpose of complying with a deadline only on general principles.

Another point is to establish a review committee, which has been inspired in the MONC, in the Multi-stakeholder Oversight Numbers Council, proposed in the Santiago meeting of LACNIC last year proposed by the LACNIC community, as I said.

During the debate it evolved into this review committee, the purpose of which is to give advice to the executive board of the NRO on the oversight of the role of the IANA functions operators. So the idea is to provide advice that this advice will not be binding, and on a regular basis, the NRO will be informed on the degree of compliance with the service. So the review committee will be closely related to the SLA.



There is a level of service and the review committee advises the NRO on the compliance of this SLA.

This review committee is not a new body. It is not cumbersome. But it will be composed of representatives of the RIRs and will accompany the NRO on the oversight and monitoring of compliance of service agreements.

In the composition of this review committee, there will be equal representation from each RIR and the expectation is that the individuals of this committee will be experts on the relevant topics, so that it will be a body of experts contributing to this oversight function.

Conclusions and next steps. There is a lot to say here, but let's be quick because we don't have much time. The first is that consensus was achieved in the Internet numbers community for the development of a consolidated proposal to be submitted to the ICG. This is great news and that was the goal to be accomplished.

This proposal in addition complies with the requirements of the US government for the transition and also the timeline was accomplished as expected so we could say that work has been successful and we have met the guidelines of the framework as set.

What are the next steps? We should wait for the ICG feedback. In this Singapore meeting, there will be sessions and discussions going on in which we will get feedback on the proposals. And also we should wait for the feedback of the name community. There is an expected new date, which could be June 15, how this plays in the case.



And something that was mentioned in the list, a recommendation was to move on with the details of the service level agreements and the composition of the review committee. That is to say while we wait for the ICG feedback, the domain name community response, we could starting ahead of us.

The CRISP team we should say works on delegation. The RIRs delegated a specific mandate upon the CRISP. So to move on with the details, we should do so in consultation with the communities that gave birth to the CRISP team. This is basically all and thank you very much.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

I have a question. For the purpose of better understanding the proposal, if I understand, you proposed that the authorization to enter a new domain name onto the root server which in the past was granted by the NTIA now will be granted by the RIRs.

ESTEBAN LESCANO:

Actually, it's not a question of domain names, but numbers. Again, the criteria is not to go through the RIRs. There will be a service provision agreement between the registries and the service provider, and everything will be handled under the agreement with the terms and conditions included in the agreement.

ERNESTO MAJO:

Ernesto Majo from LACNIC speaking, if I may add a comment. The work developed by CRISP is not related to the operational area, but only with the oversight function. Who will take the role and how will this role be



taken of oversight of the numbering resources, this function of the IANA in the absence of the US government?

So what this group has considered is that under the NRO environment there will be a review committee, the details of which are still to be developed. However, it has the purpose to check and oversee and monitor that the services are provided as per the agreement, and it is specifically on Internet numbers, not Internet names.

EDUARDO SANTOYO:

I have a question on the committees, Eseban. When you said that the committee's decisions or recommendations are not binding, I wondered if they shouldn't be mandatory neither by the contractor which is ICANN or the registries, the RIRs? Is that so?

ESTEBAN LESCANO:

Actually, this was quite debated. The idea is to have a technical body of advisory experts. Why? Because the counterpart of the operation provider, which is ICANN are the RIRs. The review committee, what can it do? It can say to the registries that there is a non-compliance and the registries will be the one who will evaluate if there is or not such non-compliance.

It is a technical advisory body. It is not mandatory. If it were mandatory, we'd be creating a new organization with powers over the agreement and the provider of technical resources. So there is not to duplicate efforts or create further complexity on the system. The counterpart of ICANN are now the RIRs, and RIRs, for the oversight function, will resort to a technical body that will provide assistance.



So moving along the same lines, this mechanism of replacement of the IANA function by ICANN perhaps is not applicable just to the relationship of IANA with the RIRs, but also with the overall Internet community. So the function of the communication secretary to oversee the compliance of the rules of the [inaudible] for the benefit support and representation of the general community of Internet, how will that be considered in your proposal, if the review committee members are only RIRs, if there are no other agents of the community involved in this relationship between ICANN of the RIRs meets the general interest of the Internet community?

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Well, this debate is very interesting, but we have another presentation. But this will be continued because I have my own thousand questions on this. So we will now – Nigel, please?

NIGEL CASSIMIRE:

Yes. Nigel Cassimire with the Caribbean Telecommunications Union. I did have a question on the presentation just concluded that I was not clear on. A mention was made of the IANA service operator, and a lot of talk about the intellectual property rights to IANA and so on and so on.

It confused me because I wasn't sure if it is that the IANA service would remain within ICANN or whether it was being taken out of ICANN. Could that be clarified for me, please?



UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

I think that the question you're raising is one that is actually being debated the most heavily in the names community. Particularly now there are two proposals and that's why the names community and Esteban made it clear. Yes, we made it on time and the names community we didn't make it on time, and we won't make it up until May or June, precisely because of that reason, precisely because there are two positions within the names community which is not divided between ccTLDs and gTLDs, but it's more of an, I would say, philosophical or ideological view of how an institution should work.

In one position, the IANA remains and the oversight bodies remain within the ICANN structure. That's called the internal position. And the other position is the external where the oversight body is another company, another organization.

But I think it's the names community which is really – it's not that I want to say the names community very important. I mean, the names community is of course the one who has the highest stakes with all this, and it is precisely that's why it is being so heavily contested.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Until now, we don't have the solution. Thank you for your question. Thank you to have Professor Antonio Alberti of INATEL. Professor Antonio Alberti, the floor is yours. Okay, you may start.

PROFESSOR ANTONIO ALBERTI: Good morning, everybody. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to participate in this meeting. I am Professor Alberti. I will talk about INATEL, how it's made up, our project which is something new in the



Internet realm. INATEL was founded in 1965. We are not getting the audio properly. Sorry.

We provide undergraduate and graduate master's degree and specialization courses. We must remember that [inaudible] also has an observatory, [inaudible] involved in our organization. This year, INATEL signed an agreement with International Telecommunications Union where [inaudible] excellence in digital [inaudible]. INATEL is receiving one million [inaudible] in funding. We have invested communications and we are already using fifth generation cell phone technology.

Please, we expect you to talk about the technical areas. Your presentation will be [inaudible] for everybody to see it later.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Could you please go into the technical part straightaway? We don't have too much time.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: We are talking about the project. We are going to say what technology we are going to develop. We developed the first project to merge our technology and to use it for Internet purposes. In 2012 we had a concept [proof] in Southern Korea, and since then we have been improving our project. What changes with this new genesis, we can see that all the entities and organizations like to give a name to everything, so we believe that everything has to be identified with a name. I'm going to tell you why it's important to give a name to everything.



We use two kinds of names. One kind of names are identified through digital signature. So we have special patterns that are very safe and don't allow access to just anybody [inaudible] verifiable patterns. These names are connected, so we created a names web, natural names and other kinds of names and these names are used to identify the goal of the communications.

On this image, we can see the name in Portuguese and the image on which we may identify the names, so we may also localize pictures in all sorts of devices. So [inaudible] the name as a target for communication. And architecture tells us how we or leads us to that name, gives us access to that name, to the content. [We define] the service. Besides, we also provide training courses in the IT realm.

We give courses on protocols and structures, and our programs and services are open. We have names. We work hard on names and people are able to find links to other courses they are interested in. Again, we go back to the names. The names are related to people and content. We consider it very important in Internet architecture to have a good service infrastructure. We need to create a network, a trusted network and trusted services, are able to exchange information. Here we can see the exchange of information and there is traceability. We can see the content and the name of the services that are being posted [inaudible] and you may go back or trace it back to the origin of that content.

This service is based on trust and reputation. If a user is not trusted, he is left out of the system. We use a data communications model and here the owner sends a content and the receiver accepts the content. This is



then of course after an authorization is granted by the one who puts up the content.

In our proposal, we also offer mobility. The ID is always the same one. What changes is the localization. The ID of the [device] of where the information comes.

In the area of the social devices, we can see that the physical world is represented through IT programs which show what comes from the physical world. The result is an ecosystem made up of social devices, self-organized world of devices. This is the architecture with the physical world with everything we want to have on the Internet represented by a set of self-organized services that work together with an assistant system controllers, managers, etc.

So we take several physical elements represented through a set of services, joint [inaudible] services orchestration. And the software defines the self-justified names.

We tested this structure in South Korea. We used the Korean network and we were able to test our ideas here. We have the results. I am not going to go into detail. This is another scenario we're working on where we used NovaGenesis as the structure, as a system, to create a cognitive network in order to expose the physical world like [inaudible]. We can see on this screen NovaGenesis self-organizes these services.

This is our team, the team working on this project. We also have some partners working in South Korea, Ireland, and Romania. This project started as a research project. We have been working with INATEL, the business arm of the project.



How do we work with INATEL? Well, usually – in this case, [inaudible] technology transfer process, software and hardware development process, and training process. So this is the business interacting with the academia. This research, again, had a proof-of-concept test and we are working in order to further develop this product. So we are working both together the research people, academia, and the business.

Finally, I'd like to pose this question. How could we work together? INATEL, the NovaGenesis project and ICANN thank you very much for your attention. Thank you, Antonio.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

I think there are several universities [inaudible]. I am going to give you my [inaudible] so when we talk about this later on, because I think it's worthwhile for you to exchange ideas with the security and stability group, which is basically a technical group within ICANN where you will be able to have very interesting discussions. I think that is the better environment to continue talking about this corporation with the ICANN people.

Thank you very much for your attention. I don't know if you have any questions for our friends. Thank you very much for being there early in the morning. Good evening to everybody.

URS EROS:

. . . Rodrigo and to Vanda to give me the opportunity to present our idea and product here in this circle. My name is Urs Erös. I am part of InterNetX, one of the oldest German registrars and biggest German registrars.



Obviously we are following the development of the I quite closely and we have been aware that a big part of the future of the Internet is not taking place in Europe or in the US, but in your countries, in your region.

This is an inference that you can not only feel, but – can we have the first slide, please? That you can not only feel, but you can read in numbers. The figures that your countries and your whole regions are presenting, they are very, very impressive and Europe, the US and all the players that have been dominating the Internet in the last years, they can only dream of these figures and this development. This is why we think that your region is very, very important and this is dominating the future. One logical consequence out of this – may I have the first slide, please? Yeah, this one. Exactly, yeah. Thank you.

One logical consequence out of these figures is that many new companies from the LAC region are entering the World Wide Web, and e-commerce is getting more and more important for all of us and this is a tendency which is going to increase in the next decades. This is nothing which is decreasing.

So what these businesses are looking for besides new customers and new opportunities is a way to present themselves in the World Wide Web and they do this via domains.

What we're seeing at the moment is the tendency that good and meaningful domains are getting more and more valuable, and naturally the capacities of the ccTLDs are limited. This is why ICANN and the whole industry have been starting this new gTLD program.



What we are focusing on in this whole program with our .LTDA, which is the product that I would like to introduce you today, is businesses in Latin America and the Caribbean.

These businesses which we would like to give a new home to are limitadas. Maybe now we can get to the second one. Limitadas meaning especially [speaking Spanish] exist in most of the countries in South America.

Numbers as well increasing here. We have about five million currently in Brazil. We have more than one million in the surrounding countries and these numbers are increasing daily as well.

So it is still a small market. It's a young market, but it's getting bigger and bigger. What we would like to do is we would like to give many of these companies who are looking for a good and meaningful domain a new home in the World Wide Web.

So if you are a registered limitada in one of your countries, you will be able to register a .LTDA domain and do your business under this domain. Reasons might be that the domain you would like to have under .COM, .BR, or .AR or whichever is already gone and you just want a nice domain which maybe matches your company name or just explains to your customers what you're doing and what you're offering.

This is not only a trend which is going to happen in Latin America, but it's a worldwide phenomenon. New strings as .LTD, .SRL, .LLP, .LLC are being started at the moment, and from our point of view, this is in a mid- and long-term scale the future of businesses on the Internet.



The tendency is going away from your country ccTLD to more meaningful, more precise, more expressive strings, and at the end of the day, these abbreviations really point out what kind of business you are, where you're registered, that you're registered somehow, who is behind it. Yeah.

We are a young registry in this field. We have only been starting with a general availability in December, so we know that there's a lot to learn, that there's a lot of things that we were not aware of where we were starting, but we are willing and open to learn and this is why I'm very happy that we get the chance to be here to meet all of you and maybe do business together in the future. We are very happy to hear your ideas about it, to get to know what you think, where this tendency is going and to learn. That is actually the main point why I'm here today is to grab the opportunity to get to know you and do business together, present you these ideas.

I hope we have the time maybe after this to share our thoughts, share ideas. I brought a colleague as well, [inaudible]. Thank you for the opportunity to get to speak to you and to get to know you. Thanks.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Thank you, Urs. I do believe that limitad is not only for Latin America, but for all Latin origin countries like Italy and Spain and Portugal and many in the Africa area that you can have – Latin origin. Thank you for your presentation. Thank you for being here. I will give the floor to our colleague from Argentina, Tony Harris.



TONY HARRIS:

Hello, everybody. I'm going to speak in English because what I'm going to refer to actually happened in the Caribbean. My name is Tony Harris. I work with the Argentina Internet Association (CABASE). I'm also a registry for .LAT. We're going live actually next Monday on the 15th. Our sunrise period begins and that is a TLD which has been the result of a partnership between ECONLAC, the Latin American Federation of the Internet and NIC Mexico. It's LAT which will be targeted to the Latino community worldwide.

But what I wanted to tell you about was what I think was a very successful exercise of the Latin American strategy group activities, which happened in Los Angeles when somebody from the fellowship – I think Janice left the room, which is a shame. But somebody from the fellowship approached me. Her name was Wanda Pérez Peña. She had come to Los Angeles as a fellow. She was actually a consultant with INDOTEL, a regulator in the Dominican Republic.

Janice and her people were kind enough to introduce us to Wanda Pérez Peña in Los Angeles, and 30 days later, I was giving a presentation in INDOTEL in the Dominican Republic with the help of Rodrigo, who is always here to help, and also Chris Mondini.

We presented to a group of 45 people in the Dominican Republic who were actually people who worked with INDOTEL with the government and with all the ISP and IT sector in the Dominican Republic. This was in Santo Domingo.

It was a full morning of just me talking to them. I don't know how they got through it, but it was something like 200 slides. Anyhow, we had a lot of questions. It was a lot of interest. Everybody wanted a copy of the



presentation. I think they went away with a clear idea of what ICANN does and how they can participate.

What you find very frequently – and I heard some comments from our colleagues here in the Caribbean during this meeting – is sometimes small and medium enterprises are not too sure how they can engage in something as big as ICANN. What can we do?

It's not all that difficult, actually. Our constituency, the ISP constituency in ICANN, we don't even charge a membership fee. You can become a member. You can be part of our list. If you want to come to a meeting, nobody is going to charge you anything. And you can keep abreast of what we are particularly interested in which is everybody should know about the new gTLD program, the new gTLDs that are coming out.

There are opportunities for branding. There are opportunities for getting a meaningful name in the Internet. If you're an operator or, let's say, an ISP or even somebody offering web hosting services, you have to be aware that there are also some technical issues involved with new gTLDs, which you will hear about.

There's a big presentation this afternoon, which is at 5:00, about universal acceptance of TLDs which I encourage everybody to go to. I am involved in the steering committee of this. At least in Latin America, my association CABASE and all the associations of Internet exchanges are committed to work on solving some problems which have arisen with new gTLDs.

That's what I wanted to say. I wanted to thank Rodrigo very much for all his help in getting this meeting done in Santo Domingo. It was a rush



job, and actually I think we just jumped in the swimming pool and swam and it came out right.

There wasn't a lot of planning. There wasn't a lot of – there were times – I mean, my computer crashed. I was in Miami. I had to buy a new computer and write a new presentation in 24 hours to be able to do this. But even with these hazards, I think it was a great experiment. You probably had some pretty good responses from that. Thank you.

[RODRIGO]: Can I say something?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Yeah, please. Thank you.

[RODRIGO]: This is the reward for the outreach contributors to have a brand new computer. Now, on a serious tone, I think this is one of the best examples of activities that we can carry out together.

Tony was not representing CABASE, but he was acting as a leader within the GNSO structure, and out of his free time, out of his vacation time, he offered to make this visit. Certainly this was a way to provide support to us and to joint work the staff and the community. Here we are to support the community and the fellows.

On the other hand, a very good example of a fellow who helped us do significant outreach – in this case, in the Dominican Republic. In my



opinion, this is a formula we should implement, which is actually happening in many cases in Latin America.

There is a strong collaboration with LACRALO, with the [inaudible] ccTLDs. I think that was the first [inaudible] importance. But it's like a partnership, so rather than thanking me, I should thank you, Tony, for your exceptional effort with very positive results. I hope we will see soon our Dominican Republic friends. As members of the constituency, we have [inaudible]. Why don't you say hi? [Emil] is also from the Dominican Republic, if you want to use the floor, it means speaking. Yes, as Tony said, we're speaking about the meeting. [inaudible] so that's when we said I was going to be here in Singapore.

And here we are, Rodrigo, available for anything you need from the Dominican Republic. We both have been in contact virtually online for some time, and I think this is a relationship we could continue on time. I am a consultant with INDOTEL. I have been working development projects in the Dominican Republic on telecommunications development, so we are aware of what is happening with ICANN, so we are more than happy to help you whenever you need it.

ALBERTO SOTO:

I have the honor of being the chair of LACRALO. Last year we were in the Dominican Republic and Haiti. I think it was in March. Wanda was one of the most enthusiastic participants there. At present, [inaudible] is about to apply for ALS. It's [inaudible] technical. There is another civil society organization that is an outcome of that [inaudible] applying for certification.



And if I'm not wrong, there is an association from Haiti created [inaudible] our trip is also applying for certification within this plan of inclusion of new ALSes in countries where we did not have coverage. So Haiti will have to be using French language in our monthly meetings as well. Thank you.

CAROLINA AGUIRRE:

I have a question from our previous presentation for Urs from limitada. I'm Carolina Aguirre from LACTLD. I think I did introduce myself initially. I wanted to know whether you were planning to have the registry operating . . . I mean, what kind of operations in the region are you looking for?

URS EROS:

Well, the registry itself is at the moment still based in Miami, but we do have a small office in Sao Paulo and we are planning to increase our activities in Latin America. We are still looking for partners there. We do not have too much experience. What I said before is really what I mean. I would like to talk to some of you after this session to maybe [intense] the contacts.

To more technical stuff, we did it as easy as possible. We come from the registrar side, so we do understand that we have to make it easy for our customers. First of all as a registry, our customers are the registrars; and at the second base, it will be the end customers. We use Afiliac as backend. We fulfill all the industry standards. We do provide our support in German, English, Spanish, and Portuguese, so really try to get in there.



That's the basic hard facts. Is there anything special you would like to know or specific?

CAROLINA AGUIRRE: Part of this ICANN LAC strategy initially, we were discussing a lot of the lack of – and you've seen this – the lack or the very few new gTLDs that were submitted from this region and how to develop DNS capacity in the region. It's interesting to see how an international registry works in the region and tries to not just to sell in the region, but also to become part of the community.

URS EROS: Absolutely. I agree. As I said before, it's a new territory for us as well. We are very open to all the ideas. We do bring our experience with us, but the region is new for us. I guess a coordination with most of you is very, very, at the end of the day, fruitful for both sides. Yeah. If there's anything we can do to help or support, please let us know.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: There is a lot of tax issues that you have to think about.

URS EROS: Especially in Brazil. That's right. It is a big part of what we're thinking about, but this is something that we can handle I guess at the end of the day.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Most of the problem is the tax issues is related to how the capacity of the population to pay that to the ISPs that's the arm that reaches really the customs in a country large like Brazil. We can talk a little bit more about that.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: There are very interesting questions in the chat of the Adobe. We need new generic top-level domains from the Caribbean and the whole region. Certainly we expect that in the next round, there will be better conditions for more registries.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: In Brazil, we have ten. But what they are actually, they're more branding than actually new gTLDs [inaudible] or something like that. Mostly they have their own network and only [inaudible] the name around that network. It's one case like [Natura, Cosmetics] and Banks that are completely closed, [inaudible] among the [inaudible] gas stations. Most of them [inaudible] I only see selling things is [.RIO].

They are running, but I don't see that they have really a marketing plan for that. I don't know what they intend to do. It was me that insist for them to apply, but I don't know if they are doing something with that. But the idea is good because [.RIO] is quite an interesting name and attractive. But most of the others are completely dedicated for their own areas. There is no other – we have already the test? No, not yet.



RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: We're running out of time. We will wait for the question to be completely written. Can we answer without having the question?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: We can answer the question afterwards in writing.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: I'm certain he wants to know when the next meeting will be. It will be in Buenos Aires and it will be a very important meeting for our region. In the past, we had ten Latin America sessions on different academic issues – security, IPv6 – so we should start analyzing how to provide greater content.

Then the second edition LAC DNS forum that is going to be led by LACTLD and the other partners – ISOC, LACNIC – [inaudible] all the partners in the region to have a great event, as the one we had last year in Buenos Aires. That's probably going to be the question. We hope to see you there.

There was a comment. She wanted to thank Janice, our remote manager participant. And also our colleagues, fellows from Nicaragua. Thank you very much, [inaudible], both for being here and assisting Janice in the Spanish part. I don't know how many other questions she had.

Again, I want to thank you all for being here in this Latin American space and the speakers especially.



VANDA SCARTEZINI:

And we want to thank the question. We are still waiting for it. It must be very important because it is considered in all the knowledge on everything we have presented. But still you can send your question and we will answer it later on.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Certainly we have the interpreters who perform great work and an applause to the group. We also want to thank our technical team. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

